

Appendix D Full Proposal External Review Factors

Each Full Proposal submitted will be sent out for review by people outside our western region who are knowledgeable about the topic of your proposed study. These external reviewers will be evaluating your Full Proposal on the basis of the following factors:

1. **Relevance to Long-range Improvements in Sustainability of US Aquaculture in the Western Region.**
2. **Regional Application and Regional Representation**
 - a. Regional application of the project and its importance in addressing problems in two or more states in the western region
 - b. Regional effort represented by the research and outreach effort.
3. **Scientific Merit**
 - a. Completeness of the descriptions of approaches and techniques to be used to conduct the research
 - b. Does the science have a well-defined objective that offers good opportunity for application by industry?
 - c. Does the project possess objectives that represent a well-defined end point?
 - d. Is the plan of research sound and well thought out and are the methods and approach valid, relevant, and innovative?
 - e. Is there an element of risk in the project? If so, what are the chances of success?
4. **Outreach Merit**
 - a. Outreach merit of the project including the completeness of the descriptions of approaches and techniques to be used to produce and deliver outreach product(s) of the project. Are the final outreach products well defined and is justification for the outreach application(s) defined?
 - b. Adequacy of the Outreach objectives and deliverables in relationship to the objectives of the proposed research. Specifically does the Outreach component of the proposal describe specific deliverable product(s) resulting from the proposed research that benefit the industry?
 - c. Adequacy of the budget to complete the objectives of the Outreach project. Are the benefits to industry of the resultant Outreach product(s) in proportion to the overall budget request of the proposal?
5. **Investigators and Institutional Capabilities (including collaborators)**
6. **Appropriateness of Budget (both research and outreach)**
 - a. Is it realistic for the proposed work?
 - b. Does the budget reflect a balance between the research and outreach efforts as related to the budget outlined for each.
7. **Other Considerations: Industry Participation**
8. **Recommendations**